



# The challenges of breeding the best varieties for Regenerative Agriculture Dr Phil Howell, NIAB

### What to expect this session

- Phil Howell, NIAB
  - Mainstream breeding, trials and seed marketing
  - Why this may not deliver for Regen Ag
  - Steps in the right direction, and thoughts about the future
- Stephanie Swarbreck, NIAB
  - Nitrogen responsiveness as a trait for sustainable agriculture
- Ambrogio Costanza, ORC
- Questions from the floor and discussion with all speakers



### Working back from mainstream markets

- Commercial breeding obviously targets varieties to suit the marketplace
- Seed royalty market is relatively small and very competitive
- Targeting niches is high risk most of the certified area is sown with AHDB RL varieties
- RL criteria therefore shape selection strategies further back in breeding programmes
- If these changed, breeders would adapt and so variety type would change
  - "In principle, the husbandry of the trial should be appropriate to achieve highest quality and yield"
  - "Nitrogen applications should be tailored to give maximum yield within the constraints of obtaining the appropriate grain protein contents for intended use" [AHDB RL protocol]

- Testing in alternative situations (e.g. low-input / direct-drilled / organic trials) often deferred until near to commercial launch, i.e. at end of selection funnel
- Organic growers often favour older varieties, as selected under pre-pesticide inputs

#### Groundswell

## Mainstream breeding

- 'Cross the best with the best and select the best'
- Marker-assisted technologies help with cross design and with early-generation selection
- Accelerated breeding (single-seed descent, doubled-haploids, shuttle breeding) can also help with early generation selection and multiplication
- Field testing often starts with untreated, inoculated nurseries: selection for disease resistance, plant type, yield components
- Yield / agronomic / predictive quality testing come later
- Selection funnel fewer lines tested at each stage, but more widely / thoroughly
- Best lines from a programme enter NL testing, best NL lines across programmes enter RL testing:
  - Each breeder 500-1000 crosses  $\rightarrow$  1-2 million F2 individuals  $\rightarrow$  5-10 NL1  $\rightarrow$  1-2 RLT  $\rightarrow$  1 successful variety

### Breeders' Equation: increasing genetic gain



'Selection intensity': how much better than the wider population are your selections

'genetic variance': how much genetic variation do you have Groundswell

8 world-class experience, skills and resources

#### Groundswell

# **Technical limitations**

- Large diverse populations screened in accurate, uniform field experiments give best gains
- Regen situations do not always make this easy
- Hard to establish min-till trials and nurseries, so selecting on fundamentally different soils
  - Trials and nursery plots are best drilled into fine tilth (often ploughed and harrowed)
  - Min-till farm drills rely on size & speed, not compatible with drilling small plots
  - Opportunity for engineering solution?
- Reducing inputs is relatively straightforward, but makes trials fundamentally less accurate
  - Soil fertility, weed burden, pest impact likely to be more variable across low-input plots, needing more replication / more locations / smarter trial design
  - If more location/years required to build a robust data set, variety development will slow
- How to select for performance in blends or intercropping?
- How to best integrate with cover crops / undersowing / living mulches / overwinter grazing?

#### Groundswell

### **Commercial limitations**

- Slower variety development might lead to increased seed prices
- Reduced inputs  $\rightarrow$  reduced yield from seed crops  $\rightarrow$  increased seed prices
- If RL selection criteria change, 'burn-in' period needed for new traits to filter through
- Or do we need separate "conventional" and "regen" lists? How will this be paid for?
- Would current high certification standards and royalty-based business model need to change?
- Variety blends and populations promise to help risk management and yield stability, but how do they fit with current royalty models?
- Will end-users (and ultimately, consumers) accept potentially lower-spec crops grown under reduced inputs?

### Steps in the right direction: research

• The public sector is funding more crop research than 20-30 years ago

• Most of this is targeting the fundamentals of how to reduce inputs

• Much more known about aspects of soil health, roots, microbiome

 DEFRA have an increased research profile, much closer to policy, with several relevant opportunities







**Biotechnology and** 

Biological Sciences Research Council



# Steps in the right direction: research

- "Pre-breeding" research moving from trait discovery in the lab to providing commercial breeders with well-adapted material
- Several BBSRC-funded multi-partner projects since 2010
- Stakeholder involvement, though largely just breeders
- Pest & disease resistance, sustainable yield improvement, improved nutrition
- Now trickling through in breeders' own improved germplasm
- Similar initiatives needed in other crops other cereals and grains, grain legumes, oilseeds, forage and fibre crops
- More support needed for long term experiments and studies







### Steps in the right direction: NIAB research

#### 12.5 Grain protein concentration (%) 0.11 0.71 0.71 0.71 0.71 PRO004 PR0057 PR0045 PRO124 . • PRO001 PRO056 SKYFALL CELLULE ROBIGUS 10.5 KWSSANTIAGO 80 85 90 95 75 100 Grain yield

Groundswell

NIAB world-class experience, skills and resources

# Steps in the right direction: AHDB response

- Since 2015, RL has raised emphasis on disease resistance relative to treated yield
  - OSR light leaf spot High  $\rightarrow$  Very high
  - Winter barley mildew Medium  $\rightarrow$  High
  - Winter wheat YR Medium  $\rightarrow$  High; mildew Medium  $\rightarrow$  High
- 'Special' RL categories to promote rapid uptake of specialist traits
  - First seen with wheat OWBM resistance
  - More recently, OSR TuYV resistance and Clearfield traits
  - Wheat BYDV resistance, winter barley BYDV tolerance
- Wheat Yellow Rust 'watch list' for varieties at higher risk of ratings falling
- Variety blends tool to help growers select suitable varieties to blend
- Evaluating trials to investigate interactions between variety & primary cultivations
- Enhanced digital access to the RL to help farmers access and understand the list, RL App, Variety selection tools



### Steps in the right direction: commercial work

- Breeders are actively using pre-breeding material
- Seed companies are tailoring their offers
  - Blends, cover crops, companion crops, specialist crops
- There is no shortage of companies offering biostimulants etc
- Lots of kit and advice is available
- Current prices and costs are making everyone look more closely at their crop inputs (and outputs)

